# The metriplectic 4-bracket: a curvature-like framework for describing dissipation in joined Hamiltonian and dissipative fluid and plasma 

Philip J. Morrison<br>Department of Physics<br>Institute for Fusion Studies, and ODEN Institute<br>The University of Texas at Austin<br>morrison@physics.utexas.edu<br>http://www.ph.utexas.edu/~morrison/

CIRM Luminy
July 28, 2023
Collaborators: G. Flierl, M. Furukawa, C. Bressan, O. Maj, M. Kraus, E. Sonnendrücker, ...
Geometry of metriplectic 4-brackets: with Michael Updike
pjm \& M. Updike, arXiv:2306.06787v1 [math-ph] 11 Jun 2023.
$\rightarrow$ Theory of thermodynamically consistent theories!

## Dynamics - Theories - Models

## Goal:

Predict the future or explain the past $\Rightarrow$

$$
\dot{z}=V(z), \quad z \in \mathcal{Z}, \text { Phase Space }
$$

A dynamical system. Maps, ODEs, PDEs, etc.

Whence vector field $V$ ?

- Fundamental parent theory (microscopic, $N$ interacting gravitating or charged particles, BBGKY hierarchy, Vlasov-Maxwell system, ...). Identify small parameters, rigorous asymptotics $\rightarrow$ Reduced Computable Model $V$.
- Phenomena based modeling using known properties, constraints, etc. used to intuit $\rightarrow$
Reduced Computable Model $V . \leftarrow$ structure can be useful.


## Types of Vector Fields, $V(z)$ (cont)

Only (?) Natural Split:

$$
V(z)=V_{H}+V_{D}
$$

- Hamiltonian vector fields, $V_{H}$ : conservative, properties, etc.
- Dissipative vector fields, $V_{D}$ : not conservative of something, relaxation/asymptotic stability, etc.


## General Hamiltonian Form:

$$
\text { finite } \operatorname{dim} \rightarrow \quad V_{H}=J \frac{\partial H}{\partial z} \quad \text { or } \quad V_{H}=\mathcal{J} \frac{\delta H}{\delta \psi} \quad \leftarrow \infty \operatorname{dim}
$$

where $J(z)$ is Poisson tensor/operator and $H$ is the Hamiltonian. Basic product decomposition.

General Dissipation:

$$
V_{D}=? \ldots \quad \rightarrow \quad V_{D}=G \frac{\partial F}{\partial z}
$$

Why investigate? General properties of theory. Build in thermodynamic consistency. Useful for computation.

## Codifying Dissipation - Some History

Is there a framework for dissipation akin to the Hamiltonian formulation for nondissipative systems?

Rayleigh (1873): $\frac{d}{d t}\left(\frac{\partial \mathcal{L}}{\partial \dot{q}_{\nu}}\right)-\left(\frac{\partial \mathcal{L}}{\partial q_{\nu}}\right)+\left(\frac{\partial \mathcal{F}}{\partial \dot{q}_{\nu}}\right)=0$
Linear dissipation e.g. of sound waves. Theory of Sound.
Cahn-Hilliard (1958): $\frac{\partial n}{\partial t}=\nabla^{2} \frac{\delta F}{\delta n}=\nabla^{2}\left(n^{3}-n-\nabla^{2} n\right)$
Phase separation, nonlinear diffusive dissipation, binary fluid ..
Other Gradient Flows: $\frac{\partial \psi}{\partial t}=\mathcal{G} \frac{\delta F}{\delta \psi}$
Otto, Ricci Flows, Poincarè conjecture on $S^{3}$, Perelman (2002)...

## Metriplectic Dynamics

## (Metric $\cup$ Symplectic Flows)

- Formalism for natural split of vector fields
- Enforces thermodynamic consistency: $\dot{H}=0$ the 1st Law and $\dot{S} \geq 0$ the 2nd Law. Other invariants?
- Encompassing 4-bracket theory: "curvature" as dissipation

Ideas of Casimirs are candidates for entropy, multibracket, curvature, etc. in PJM, Bracket formulation for irreversible classical fields, Phys. Lett. A 100, 423-427 (1984). Metriplectic in P. J. Morrison, Physica D 18, 410 (1986)

## Poisson Brackets - Flows on Poisson Manifolds

Definition. A Poisson manifold $\mathcal{Z}$ has bracket

$$
\{,\}: C^{\infty}(\mathcal{Z}) \times C^{\infty}(\mathcal{Z}) \rightarrow C^{\infty}(\mathcal{Z})
$$

st $C^{\infty}(\mathcal{Z})$ with $\{$,$\} is a Lie algebra realization, i.e., is$

- bilinear,
- antisymmetric,
- Jacobi, and
- Leibniz, i.e., acts as a derivation $\Rightarrow$ vector field.

Geometrically $C^{\infty}(\mathcal{Z}) \equiv \Lambda^{0}(\mathcal{Z})$ and $\boldsymbol{d}$ exterior derivative.

$$
\{f, g\}=J(\boldsymbol{d} f \wedge \boldsymbol{d} g)=\langle\boldsymbol{d} f, J \boldsymbol{d} g\rangle=J(\boldsymbol{d} f, \boldsymbol{d} g)
$$

$J$ the Poisson tensor/operator. Flows are integral curves of noncanonical Hamiltonian vector fields, $J \boldsymbol{d} H$, i.e., $\dot{z}^{i}=J^{i j} \partial H / \partial z^{j}$.

Because of degeneracy, $\exists$ functions $C$ st $\{f, C\}=0$ for all $f \in$ $C^{\infty}(\mathcal{Z})$. Casimir invariants (Lie's distinguished functions!).

## Poisson Manifold (phase space) $\mathcal{Z}$ Cartoon

Degeneracy in $J \Rightarrow$ Casimirs:

$$
\{f, C\}=0 \quad \forall f: \mathcal{Z} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}
$$

Lie-Darboux Foliation by Casimir (symplectic) leaves:


Metriplectic 4-Bracket: ( $f, k ; g, n$ )

## Why a 4-Bracket?

- Two slots for two fundamental functions: Hamiltonian, $H$, and Entropy (Casimir), S.
- Leaves two slots for bilinear bracket: one for observable one for generator s.t. $\dot{H}=0$ and $\dot{S} \geq 0$.
- Provides natural reductions to other bilinear brackets.
- The three slot brackets of pjm 1984 were not trilinear. Four needed to be multilinear.


## The Metriplectic 4-Bracket

4-bracket on 0-forms (functions):

$$
(\cdot, \cdot ; \cdot, \cdot): \Lambda^{0}(\mathcal{Z}) \times \Lambda^{0}(\mathcal{Z}) \times \Lambda^{0}(\mathcal{Z}) \times \Lambda^{0}(\mathcal{Z}) \rightarrow \Lambda^{0}(\mathcal{Z})
$$

For functions $f, k, g, n \in \Lambda^{0}(\mathcal{Z})$

$$
(f, k ; g, n):=R(\boldsymbol{d} f, \boldsymbol{d} k, \boldsymbol{d} g, \boldsymbol{d} n)
$$

In a coordinate patch the metriplectic 4-bracket has the form:

$$
(f, k ; g, n)=R^{i j k l}(z) \frac{\partial f}{\partial z^{i}} \frac{\partial k}{\partial z^{j}} \frac{\partial g}{\partial z^{k}} \frac{\partial n}{\partial z^{l}} . \quad \leftarrow \text { quadravector? }
$$

- A blend of ideas: Two important functions $H$ and $S$, symmetries, curvature idea, multilinear brackets all in pjm 1984, 1986.
- Manifolds with both Poisson tensor $J$ and compatible metric, $g$ or connection.


## Metriplectic 4-Bracket Properties

(i) linearity in all arguments, e.g,

$$
(f+h, k ; g, n)=(h, k ; g, n)+(h, k ; g, n)
$$

(ii) algebraic identities/symmetries

$$
\begin{aligned}
& (f, k ; g, n)=-(k, f ; g, n) \\
& (f, k ; g, n)=-(f, k ; n, g) \\
& (f, k ; g, n)=(g, n ; f, k) \\
& (f, k ; g, n)+(f, g ; n, k)+(f, n ; k, g)=0 \quad \leftarrow \text { not needed }
\end{aligned}
$$

(iii) derivation in all arguments, e.g.,

$$
(f h, k ; g, n)=f(h, k ; g, n)+(f, k ; g, n) h
$$

which is manifest when written in coordinates. Here, as usual, $f h$ denotes pointwise multiplication. Symmetries of algebraic curvature. Although $R^{l}{ }_{i j k}$ or $R_{l i j k}$ but not $R^{l i j k}$. Metriplectic Minimum.

## Reduction to Metriplectic 2-Bracket

 (PJM 1984, 1986)Symmetric 2-bracket:

$$
(f, g)_{H}=(f, H ; g, H)=(g, f)_{H}
$$

Dissipative dynamics:

$$
\dot{z}=(z, S)_{H}=(z, H ; S, H)
$$

Energy conservation:

$$
(f, H)_{H}=(H, f)_{H}=0 \quad \forall f
$$

Entropy dynamics:

$$
\dot{S}=(S, S)_{H}=(S, H ; S, H) \geq 0
$$

Metriplectic 4-brackets $\rightarrow$ metriplectic 2-brackets of 1984, 1986!

## Metriplectic 4-Bracket: Encompassing Definition of Dissipation

- Lots of geometry on Poisson manifolds with metric or connection. Emerges naturally.
- If Riemannian, entropy production is positive contravariant sectional curvature. For $\sigma, \eta \in \Lambda^{1}(\mathcal{Z})$, entropy production by

$$
\dot{S}=K(\sigma, \eta):=(S, H ; S, H)
$$

where the second equality follows if $\sigma=\boldsymbol{d} S$ and $\eta=\boldsymbol{d} H$.

## Binary Brackets for Dissipation circa $1980 \rightarrow$

- Symmetric Bilinear Brackets (pjm 1980 -. . . unpublished, 1984 reduced MHD)
- Antisymmetric Bracket (possibly degenerate) (Kaufman and pjm 1982)
- Metriplectic Dynamics (pjm 1984,1984, 1986, ...Kaufman 1984 no degeneracy)
- GENERIC (Grmela 1984, with Oettinger 1997, ...) Binary but not Symmetric and not Bilinear $\Leftrightarrow$ Metriplectic Dynamics!
- Double Brackets (Vallis, Carnevale, Young, Shepherd; Brockett, Bloch ... 1989)


## 4-Bracket Reduction to K-M Brackets

## (Kaufman and Morrison 1982)

Done for plasma quasilinear theory.

Dynamics:

$$
\dot{z}=[z, H]_{S}=(z, H ; S, H)
$$

Bracket Properties:

$$
[f, g]_{S}=(f, g ; S, H)
$$

- bilinear
- antisymmetric, possibly degenerate
- energy conservation and entropy production

$$
\dot{H}=[H, H]_{S}=0 \quad \text { and } \quad \dot{S}=[S, H]_{S} \geq 0 \quad \Rightarrow \quad z \mapsto z_{e q}
$$

## 4-Bracket Reduction to Double Brackets

## (Vallis, Carnevale; Brockett, Bloch ... 1989)

Interchanging the role of $H$ with a Casimir $S$ :

$$
(f, g)_{S}=(f, S ; g, S)
$$

Can show with assumptions (Koszul construction)

$$
(C, g)_{S}=(C, S ; g, S)=0
$$

for any Casimir $C$. Therefore $\dot{C}=0$.

Practical tool for equilibria computation $\rightarrow$ Beautiful geometry with Fernandes-Koszul connection!

## 4-Bracket Reduction GENERIC

## (Grmela 1984, with Öttinger 1997)

- Bracket not bilinear and not symmetric

GENERIC Vector Field in terms of dissipation function $\equiv\left(z, z_{*}\right)$ :

$$
\dot{z}^{i}=Y_{S}^{i}=\left.\frac{\partial \equiv\left(z, z_{*}\right)}{\partial z_{* i}}\right|_{z_{*}=\partial S / \partial z}
$$

Special Case:

$$
\equiv\left(z, z_{*}\right)=\frac{1}{2} \frac{\partial S}{\partial z^{i}} G^{i j}(z) \frac{\partial S}{\partial z^{j}} \quad \Rightarrow \quad Y_{S}^{i}=G^{i j}(z) \frac{\partial S}{\partial z^{j}}
$$

- Exists a bracket and procedure for linearizing and symmetrizing $\Rightarrow$

$$
\text { GENERIC }(1997) \equiv \text { Metriplectic }(1984,1986)!
$$

## Existence - General Constructions

- For any Riemannian manifold $\exists$ metriplectic 4-bracket. This means there is a wide class of them, but the bracket tensor does not need to come from Riemann tensor only needs to satisfy the bracket properties.
- Methods of construction?


## Construction via Kulkarni-Nomizu Product

Given $\sigma$ and $\mu$, two symmetric rank-2 tensor fields operating on 1 -forms $\boldsymbol{d} f, \boldsymbol{d} k$ and $\boldsymbol{d} g, \boldsymbol{d} n$, the K-N product is

$$
\begin{aligned}
\sigma ® \mu(\boldsymbol{d} f, \boldsymbol{d} k, \boldsymbol{d} g, \boldsymbol{d} n) & =\sigma(\boldsymbol{d} f, \boldsymbol{d} g) \mu(\boldsymbol{d} k, \boldsymbol{d} n) \\
& -\sigma(\boldsymbol{d} f, \boldsymbol{d} n) \mu(\boldsymbol{d} k, \boldsymbol{d} g) \\
& +\mu(\boldsymbol{d} f, \boldsymbol{d} g) \sigma(\boldsymbol{d} k, \boldsymbol{d} n) \\
& -\mu(\boldsymbol{d} f, \boldsymbol{d} n) \sigma(\boldsymbol{d} k, \boldsymbol{d} g)
\end{aligned}
$$

Metriplectic 4-bracket:

$$
(f, k ; g, n)=\sigma \boxtimes \mu(\boldsymbol{d} f, \boldsymbol{d} k, \boldsymbol{d} g, \boldsymbol{d} n)
$$

In coordinates:

$$
R^{i j k l}=\sigma^{i k} \mu^{j l}-\sigma^{i l} \mu^{j k}+\mu^{i k} \sigma^{j l}-\mu^{i l} \sigma^{j k}
$$

## Lie-Algebra Based Metriplectic 4-Brackets

- For structure constants $c^{k l}$ :

$$
(f, k ; g, n)=c^{i j}{ }_{r} c^{k l}{ }_{s} g^{r s} \frac{\partial f}{\partial z^{i}} \frac{\partial k}{\partial z^{j}} \frac{\partial g}{\partial z^{k}} \frac{\partial n}{\partial z^{l}} .
$$

Lacks symmetry, but $\exists$ procedure to remove torsion (cyclic Bianchi identity) for any symmetric 'metric' $g^{r s}$. Dynamics does not see torsion, but manifold does.

- For $g_{C K}^{r s}=c^{r l}{ }_{k} c^{s k}$ the Cartan-Killing metric, torsion vanishes automatically


## Examples

- finite-dimensional
- $1+1$ fluid theory
- 3+1 fluid theory
- kinetic theory


## Free Rigid Body

Angular momenta ( $L^{1}, L^{2}, L^{3}$ ), Lie-Poisson bracket with Lie algebra $\mathfrak{s o}(3), c_{k}^{i j}=-\epsilon_{i j k}$.

Hamiltonian:

$$
H=\frac{\left(L^{1}\right)^{2}}{2 I_{1}}+\frac{\left(L^{2}\right)^{2}}{2 I_{2}}+\frac{\left(L^{3}\right)^{2}}{2 I_{3}}
$$

principal moments of inertia, $I_{i}$ Casimir

$$
C=\|L\|^{2}=\left(L^{1}\right)^{2}+\left(L^{3}\right)^{2}+\left(L^{3}\right)^{2}=S,
$$

Euler's equations:

$$
\dot{L}^{i}=\left\{L^{i}, H\right\}
$$

"Thermodynamics" $\rightarrow$ design a system s.t. $\dot{H}=0$ and $\dot{S} \leq 0$.

## "Thermodynamics" Free Rigid Body

Use K-N product. Choose $\sigma^{i j}=\mu^{i j}=g^{i j} \Rightarrow$

$$
R^{i j k l}=K\left(g^{i k} g^{j l}-g^{i l} g^{j k}\right),
$$

Riemannian Space form with constant sectional curvature $K$.

Assume Euclidean gives metriplectic 4-bracket:

$$
(f, k ; g, n)=K\left(\delta^{i k} \delta^{j l}-\delta^{i l} \delta^{j k}\right) \frac{\partial f}{\partial z^{i}} \frac{\partial k}{\partial z^{j}} \frac{\partial g}{\partial z^{k}} \frac{\partial n}{\partial z^{l}},
$$

Metriplectic 2-bracket:

$$
(f, g)_{H}=(f, H ; g, H)
$$

Precisely bracket and dynamics of pjm 1986!

$$
\dot{L}^{i}=\left\{L^{i}, H\right\}+\left(L^{i}, S\right)_{H}=\left\{L^{i}, H\right\}+\left(L^{i}, H ; S, H\right)
$$

## 1D fluid $u(x, t)$

Again use K-N product with operators $\Sigma$ and $M$

$$
\begin{aligned}
&(F, K ; G, N)=\int_{\mathbb{R}} d x W\left(\Sigma\left(F_{u}, G_{u}\right) M\left(K_{u}, N_{u}\right)\right. \\
&-\Sigma\left(F_{u}, N_{u}\right) M\left(K_{u}, G_{u}\right)+M\left(F_{u}, G_{u}\right) \Sigma\left(K_{u}, N_{u}\right) \\
&\left.-M\left(F_{u}, N_{u}\right) \Sigma\left(K_{u}, G_{u}\right)\right),
\end{aligned}
$$

$W$ a constant and $F_{u}=\delta F / \delta u$, etc.
Choose

$$
\begin{gathered}
M\left(F_{u}, G_{u}\right)=F_{u} G_{u} \\
\Sigma\left(F_{u}, G_{u}\right)(x)=\partial F_{u}(x) \mathcal{H}\left[G_{u}\right](x)+\partial G_{u}(x) \mathcal{H}\left[F_{u}\right](x),
\end{gathered}
$$

$\partial=\partial / \partial x$ and $\mathcal{H}$ the Hilbert transform $\Rightarrow$

$$
\begin{gathered}
(F, G)_{H}=(F, H ; G, H)=\int_{\mathbb{R}} d x W\left(\partial F_{u} \mathcal{H}\left[G_{u}\right]+\partial G_{u} \mathcal{H}\left[F_{u}\right]\right) . \\
u_{t}=\ldots(u, S)_{H}=-2 W \mathcal{H}[\partial u] .
\end{gathered}
$$

Ott \& Sudan 1969 fluid model of electron Landau damping (Hammett-Perkins 1990).

## Thermodynamic Navier-Stokes:

$$
\chi=\{\rho, \sigma=\rho s, \boldsymbol{M}=\rho \boldsymbol{v}\}
$$

K-N again:

$$
\begin{gathered}
M\left(F_{\chi}, G_{\chi}\right)=F_{\sigma} G_{\sigma} \\
\Sigma\left(F_{\chi}, G_{\chi}\right)=\widehat{\Lambda}_{i j k l} \partial_{j} F_{M_{i}} \partial_{k} G_{M_{l}}+a \nabla F_{\sigma} \cdot \nabla G_{\sigma}
\end{gathered}
$$

$\partial_{i}:=\partial / \partial x^{i}$ with general isotropic Cartesian tensor of order 4

$$
\hat{\Lambda}_{i k s t}=\alpha \delta_{i k} \delta_{s t}+\beta\left(\delta_{i s} \delta_{k t}+\delta_{i t} \delta_{k s}\right)+\gamma\left(\delta_{i s} \delta_{k t}-\delta_{i t} \delta_{k s}\right)
$$

Construct

$$
(F, G)_{H}=(F, H ; G, H) \quad \rightarrow \quad \chi_{t}=\{\chi, H\}+(\chi, S)_{H} \Rightarrow
$$

using $S=\int d^{3} x \rho s$ and $H=\int d^{3} x\left(\rho|\boldsymbol{v}|^{2} / 2+\rho U(\rho, s)\right)$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\partial_{t} \boldsymbol{v} & =-\boldsymbol{v} \cdot \nabla \boldsymbol{v}-\frac{1}{\rho} \nabla p+\frac{1}{\rho} \nabla \cdot \mathcal{T} \\
\partial_{t} \rho & =-\nabla \cdot(\rho \boldsymbol{v}) \\
\partial_{t} s & =-\boldsymbol{v} \cdot \nabla s-\frac{1}{\rho T} \nabla \cdot \boldsymbol{q}+\frac{1}{\rho T} \mathcal{T}: \nabla \boldsymbol{v}, \quad \boldsymbol{q}=-\kappa \nabla T
\end{aligned}
$$

## Collision Operator

Phase space $z=(\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{v})$, density $f(z, t)$
Define operator on $w: \mathbb{R}^{6} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ (at fixed time)

$$
\begin{aligned}
& P[w]_{i}=\frac{\partial w(z)}{\partial v_{i}}-\frac{\partial w\left(z^{\prime}\right)}{\partial v_{i}^{\prime}} \\
&(F, K ; G, N)= \int d^{6} z \int^{6} z^{\prime} \mathcal{G}\left(z, z^{\prime}\right) \\
& \times(\delta \otimes \delta)_{i j k l} P\left[F_{f}\right]_{i} P\left[K_{f}\right]_{j} P\left[G_{f}\right]_{k} P\left[N_{f}\right]_{l},
\end{aligned}
$$

where simplest $\mathrm{K}-\mathrm{N}$

$$
(\delta \otimes \delta)_{i j k l}=2\left(\delta_{i k} \delta_{j l}-\delta_{i l} \delta_{j k}\right) .
$$

with $S=-\int d^{z} f \ln f$

$$
(f, H ; S H)=? ?
$$

Landau-Lenard-Balescu collision operator!
Metriplectic 2-bracket $(f, g)_{H}$ in pjm 1984 again!

## Final Comments

- See PJM \& M. Updike, arXiv:2306.06787v1 [math-ph] 11 Jun 2023 for many more examples, finite and infinite.
- Useful for thermodynamically consistent model building, e.g., multiphase flow with many constitutive relation effects.
- Given that double brackets and metriplectic brackets have been used for computation of equilibria, metriplectic 4-bracket can be a new tool.
- New kind of structure to preserve: Symplectic, Poisson, FEEC, .... metriplectic 2-bracket, metriplectic 4-bracket?


## References:

[1] P. J. Morrison and J. M. Greene, Phys. Rev. Lett. 45, 790 (1980)
[2] P. J. Morrison, AIP Conf. Proc. 88, 13 (1982)
[3] P. J. Morrison and R. D. Hazeltine, Phys. Fluids 27, 886 (1984)
[4] A. N. Kaufman and P. J. Morrison, Phys. Lett. A 88, 405 (1982)
[5] A. N. Kaufman, Phys. Lett. A 100, 419 (1984)
[6] P. J. Morrison, Phys. Lett. A 100, 423 (1984)
[7] P. J. Morrison, Tech. Rep. PAM-228, Univ. Calif. Berkeley (1984)
[8] P. J. Morrison, Physica D 18, 410 (1986)
[9] P. J. Morrison, J. Physics: Conf. Ser. 169, 012006 (2009)
[10] M. Materassi and P. J. Morrison, J. Cybernetics \& Physics 7, 78 (2015)
[11] B. Coquinot and P. J. Morrison, J. Plasma Phys. 86, 835860302 (2020)
[12] P. J. Morrison, Phys. Plasmas 24, 055502 (2017)
[13] M. Kraus and E. Hirvijok, Phys. Plasmas 24, 102311 (2017)
[14] C. Bressan, M. Kraus, P. J. Morrison, and O. Maj, J. Phys.: Conf. Series 1125, 012002 (2018)
[15] C. Bressan, Ph.D. thesis, Technical University of Munich (2022)
[16] R. W. Brockett, Proc. IEEE 27, 799 (1988)
[17] G. Vallis, G. Carnevale, and W. Young, J. Fluid Mech. 207, 133 (1989)
[18] G. R. Flierl and P. J. Morrison, Physica D 240, 212 (2011)
[19] G. R. Flierl, P. J. Morrison, and R. V. Swaminathan, Fluids: Topical Collection "Geophysical Fluid Dynamics" 4, 104 (2019)
[20] M. Furukawa and P. J. Morrison, Plasma Phys. Control. Fusion 59, 054001 (2017)
[21] M. Furukawa, T. Watanabe, P. J. Morrison, and K. Ichiguchi, Phys. Plasmas 25, 082506 (2018)
[22] M. Furukawa and P. J. Morrison, Phys. Plasmas 29, 102504 (2022)
[23] P. J. Morrison and M. H. Updike, arXiv:2306.06787v1 [math-ph] 11 Jun 2023.

